

THE CORNELL LAW SCHOOL

MYRON TAYLOR HALL

Officers of Administration

Eduardo M. Peñalver, B.A., M.A., J.D., Allan R. Tessler Dean and Professor of Law
Barbara J. Holden-Smith, B.A., J.D., Vice Dean and Professor of Law
Femi Cadmus, LL.B., B.L., LL.M., M.L.I.S., Edward Cornell Law Librarian, Associate Dean for Library Services, and Senior Lecturer in Law
Peter Cronin, B.A., Associate Dean, Alumni Affairs and Development
John R. DeRosa, B.S., J.D., Assistant Dean for Student and Career Services
Martha P. Fitzgerald, B.A., Associate Dean for Communications
Monica K. Ingram, B.A., J.D., Associate Dean of Admissions and Financial Aid
Sheri Lynn Johnson, B.A., J.D., Associate Dean for Public Engagement, James and Mark Flanagan Professor of Law, and Assistant Director, Cornell Death Penalty Project
Markeisha J. Miner, B.A., J.D., Dean of Students
Jens David Ohlin, B.A., M.A., M.Phil., Ph.D., J.D., Associate Dean for Academic Affairs and Professor of Law
Richard F. Robinson, B.S., M.B.A., M.P.H., Associate Dean for Administration and Finance
Laura M. Spitz, B.A., LL.B., J.S.D., Interim Vice Provost for International Affairs, Cornell University, and Associate Dean for International Affairs
Karen V. Comstock, B.S., J.D., Assistant Dean for Public Service
Aimée Houghton, B.A., J.D., Assistant Dean for Graduate Legal Studies
Elizabeth K. Peck, B.A., J.D., Assistant Dean for Professional Development and Clerkships

Faculty

Gregory S. Alexander, B.A., J.D., A. Robert Noll Professor of Law
Joel Atlas, B.A., J.D., Director, Lawyering Program and Clinical Professor of Law
Kim K. Azzarelli, A.B., J.D., Adjunct Professor of Law (Fall 2015)
Sandra L. Babcock, B.A., J.D., Clinical Professor of Law
Marion J. Bachrach, B.A., M.A., J.D., Adjunct Professor of Law (Fall 2015)
John J. Barceló III, B.A., J.D., S.J.D., William Nelson Cromwell Professor of International and Comparative Law
Gary Barnett, B.S., J.D., LL.M., Adjunct Professor of Law (Fall 2015)
F. Gregory Barnhart, A.B., J.D., Adjunct Professor of Law (Fall 2015)
H. Richard Beresford, B.A., J.D., M.D., Adjunct Professor of Law (Fall 2015)
Nathalia A. Bernardo, B.E.A., J.D., Adjunct Professor of Law (Fall 2015)
Celia W. Bigoness, A.B., J.D., Assistant Clinical Professor of Law (Lawyering Program)
Franci J. Blassberg, A.B., J.D., Visiting Professor of the Practice (Fall 2015)
John H. Blume, B.A., M.A.R., J.D., Samuel F. Leibowitz Professor of Trial Techniques, Director of Clinical, Advocacy and Skills Program, and Director, Cornell Death Penalty Project
Cynthia Grant Bowman, B.A., Ph.D., J.D., Dorothea S. Clarke Professor of Law
Wendy L. Brown, B.A., Ph.D., Visiting Professor of Government and Law (Fall 2015)
Thomas R. Bruce, B.A., M.F.A., Research Associate and Director, Legal Information Institute
Elizabeth Brundige, B.A., M. Phil., J.D., Assistant Clinical Professor of Law and Executive Director, Avon Global Center for Women and Justice
Bruce R. Bryan, B.A., J.D., Adjunct Professor of Law (Fall 2015)
Femi Cadmus, LL.B., B.L., LL.M., M.L.I.S., Edward Cornell Law Librarian, Associate Dean for Library Services, and Senior Lecturer in Law
Joseph Callery, B.A., J.D., Adjunct Professor of Law (2015–2016)
Terry Calvani, B.A., J.D., Adjunct Professor of Law (Spring 2016)
Josh Chafetz, B.A., D.Phil., J.D., Professor of Law
Dawn Chutkow, A.B., J.D., Ph.D., Visiting Professor of Law (2014–2019)
Kevin M. Clermont, A.B., J.D., Robert D. Ziff Professor of Law
Zachary D. Clopton, B.A., M.Phil., J.D., Assistant Professor of Law
Steven D. Clymer, B.A., J.D., Adjunct Professor of Law (Spring 2016)
Sherry F. Colb, A.B., J.D., Professor of Law and Charles Evans Hughes Scholar
Angela B. Cornell, B.A., J.D., Clinical Professor of Law and Director, Labor Law Clinic
James W. Dabney, A.B., J.D., Adjunct Professor of Law (Spring 2016)
Samuel D. Dahan, Ph.D., LL.M., Adjunct Professor of Law (January 2016 Intersession)
Michael C. Dorf, B.A., J.D., Robert S. Stevens Professor of Law
Susan E. Emmenegger, J.D., LL.M., Ph.D., Dr. Habil., Adjunct Professor of Law (Fall 2015)
Cynthia R. Farina, B.A., J.D., William G. McRoberts Research Professor in Administration of the Law
Jonathan W. Feldman, B.A., J.D., Adjunct Professor of Law (Fall 2015)
Michelle A. Fongyee Whelan, B.A., J.D., Clinical Professor of Law (Lawyering Program)
Charles M. Fox, B.A., J.D., Adjunct Professor of Law (Fall 2015)
Lara G. Freed, B.S., J.D., Clinical Professor of Law (Lawyering Program)
Jim Fulton, B.S., J.D., Adjunct Professor of Law (Fall 2015)
Glenn G. Galbreath, B.A., J.D., Clinical Professor of Law
John Gardner, B.C.L., M.A., D.Phil., Marc and Beth Goldberg Distinguished Visiting Professor of Law (Fall 2015)
Elizabeth Garrett, B.A., J.D., President, Cornell University and Professor of Law, Government, and Management
Stephen P. Garvey, B.A., M.Phil., J.D., Professor of Law
Neil V. Getnick, B.A., J.D., Adjunct Professor of Law (Spring 2016)
Toby Goldbach, J.D., LL.M., Adjunct Professor of Law and Postdoctoral Associate, Graduate Legal Studies Program
Sergio Alberto Gramitto Ricci, J.D., Ph.D., Adjunct Professor of Law (Fall 2015)
Robert A. Green, B.A., M.S., J.D., Professor of Law
Jonathan D. Grossberg, B.A., J.D., LL.M., Adjunct Professor of Law (Spring 2016)
Lewis A. Grossman, B.A., J.D., Ph.D., Visiting Professor of Law (Fall 2015)
Valerie P. Hans, B.A., M.A., Ph.D., Professor of Law
George A. Hay, B.S., M.A., Ph.D., Charles Frank Reavis Sr. Professor of Law and Professor of Economics
Susan Hazeldean, B.A., J.D., Associate Clinical Professor of Law
Thomas J. Heiden, B.A., J.D., Adjunct Professor of Law (January 2016 Intersession)
Michael Heise, A.B., J.D., Ph.D., Professor of Law
Robert A. Hillman, A.B., J.D., Edwin H. Woodruff Professor of Law
Robert C. Hockett, B.A., M.A., J.D., LL.M., J.S.D., Edward Cornell Professor of Law
Barbara J. Holden-Smith, B.A., J.D., Vice Dean and Professor of Law

Arnold S. Jacobs, B.M.E., M.B.A., LL.B., Adjunct Professor of Law (Spring 2016)

William A. Jacobson, B.A., J.D., Clinical Professor of Law and Director, Securities Law Clinic

Sheri Lynn Johnson, B.A., J.D., Associate Dean for Public Engagement, James and Mark Flanagan Professor of Law, and Assistant Director, Cornell Death Penalty Project

James J. Junewicz, B.S.F.S., M.B.A., J.D., LL.M., Adjunct Professor of Law (2015–2016)

Sital Kalantry, A.B., M.Sc., J.D., Clinical Professor of Law

Takayuki Kihira, LL.B., LL.M., Adjunct Professor of Law (Fall 2015)

Susan C. Knight, B.A., M.A., Ph.D., Adjunct Professor of Law (Spring 2016)

Sarah Kreps, B.A., M.Sc., Ph.D., Associate Professor of Government and Adjunct Professor of Law (2015–2016)

Mitchel D. Lasser, B.A., J.D., M.A., Ph.D., Jack G. Clarke Professor of Law and Director, Graduate Studies

Stephane Levy, B.C., B.C.L., LL.B., Adjunct Professor of Law (Fall 2015)

Odette Lienau, A.B., M.A., J.D., Ph.D., Associate Professor of Law

Oskar Liivak, B.S., Ph.D., J.D., Professor of Law

David B. Lipsky, B.S., Ph.D., Anne Evans Estabrook Professor of Dispute Resolution, Director, Scheinman Institute, School of Industrial and Labor Relations, and Adjunct Professor of Law (Spring 2016)

Beth Lyon, B.A., M.S., J.D., Clinical Professor of Law

Joseph Margulies, B.A., J.D., Professor of Law and Visiting Professor of Government

Andrei Marmor, B.A., LL.B., M.A., D.Phil., Jacob Gould Schurman Professor of Philosophy and Law

Edward McArdle, B.A., J.D., Adjunct Professor of Law (2015–2016)

Bryan A. McGrane, A.B., J.D., LL.M., Adjunct Professor of Law (Spring 2016)

Estelle M. McKee, B.A., J.D., Clinical Professor of Law (Lawyering Program)

Ryan D. McNaughton, B.A., J.D., Adjunct Professor of Law (Spring 2016)

Kelly Mellecker, B.A., J.D., Adjunct Professor of Law (Spring 2016)

Jill Miller, B.S., J.D., LL.M., Adjunct Professor of Law (Spring 2016)

James J. Mingle, B.A., J.D., University Counsel and Adjunct Professor of Law (Fall 2015)

Andrea J. Mooney, B.A., M.Ed., J.D., Clinical Professor of Law (Lawyering Program)

Greg Murphy, B.A., J.D., Distinguished Practitioner-in-Residence (Fall 2015)

Muna B. Ndulo, LL.B., LL.M., D.Phil., Professor of Law, Elizabeth and Arthur Reich Director, Leo and Arvilla Berger International Legal Studies Program, and Director, Institute for African Development

Mary J. Newhart, B.S., M.S., Executive Director, Cornell eRulemaking Initiative and Adjunct Professor of Law (2015–2016)

Sandile Ngcobo, LL.B., LL.M., Adjunct Professor of Law (Fall 2015)

Maureen O'Hara, B.S., M.A., Ph.D., Robert W. Purcell Professorship of Management (JGSM) & Adjunct Professor of Law (Fall 2015)

Jens David Ohlin, B.A., M.A., M.Phil., Ph.D., J.D., Associate Dean for Academic Affairs and Professor of Law

Michael Olivas, B.A., M.A., Ph.D., J.D., Adjunct Professor of Law (January 2016 Intercession)

Saule T. Omarova, B.A., M.A., Ph.D., J.D., Professor of Law

Martin O'Toole, A.B., J.D., Adjunct Professor of Law (Spring 2016)

Eduardo M. Penalver, B.A., M.A., J.D., Allan R. Tessler Dean and Professor of Law

Keith S. Porter, B.A., LL.M., Adjunct Professor of Law (Spring 2016)

David S. Powers, B.A., M.A., Ph.D., Professor of Arabic and Islamic Studies and Adjunct Professor of Law (Spring 2016)

Jeffrey J. Rachlinski, B.A., M.A., J.D., Ph.D., Henry Allen Mark Professor of Law

Neil N. Radey, M.B.A., J.D., Adjunct Professor of Law (Spring 2016)

Anthony M. Radice, A.B., J.D., Adjunct Professor of Law (Fall 2015)

Aziz F. Rana, A.B., M.A., J.D., Ph.D., Professor of Law

Patricia A. Ranieri, B.A., J.D., M.B.A., Adjunct Professor of Law (Fall 2015)

Dana Remus, A.B., J.D., Visiting Professor of Law (Fall 2015)

Annelise Riles, A.B., M.Sc., J.D., Ph.D., Jack G. Clarke Professor of Far East Legal Studies, Professor of Anthropology, and Director, Clarke Program in East Asian Law and Culture

Charles E. Roberts, B.A., J.D., Adjunct Professor of Law (2015–2016)

Menachem Z. Rosensaft, B.A., M.A., M.A., J.D., Adjunct Professor of Law (Fall 2015)

Lance Salisbury, B.S., M.A., M.R.P., J.D., Adjunct Professor of Law (Fall 2015)

Robert A. Sarachan, B.A., B.S., M.B.A., J.D., M.S., Adjunct Professor of Law (Spring 2016)

Alexander Sarch, M.A., Ph.D., Adjunct Professor of Law (Spring 2016)

Rocco M. Scanza, B.A., J.D., Executive Director, Martin and Laurie Scheinman Institute on Conflict Resolution, School of Industrial and Labor Relations, and Adjunct Professor of Law (2015–2016)

Gregory A. Scopino, B.A., J.D., Adjunct Professor of Law (Fall 2015)

Stewart J. Schwab, B.A., M.A., J.D., Ph.D., Jonathan and Ruby Zhu Professor of Law

Emily L. Sherwin, B.A., J.D., Frank B. Ingersoll Professor of Law

Birgitta K. Siegel, B.S., J.D., Adjunct Professor of Law (2015–2016)

Jonathan D. Siegfried, B.A., J.D., Adjunct Professor of Law (Fall 2015)

John A. Siliciano, B.A., M.P.A., J.D., Senior Vice Provost for Academic Affairs and Professor of Law

Andrew J. Stamelman, B.A., J.D., LL.M., Adjunct Professor of Law (Spring 2016)

Jed Stiglitz, B.A., M.A., Ph.D., J.D., Assistant Professor of Law and Jia Jonathan Zhu and Ruyin Ruby Ye Sesquicentennial Fellow

Lynn A. Stout, B.A., M.P.A., J.D., Distinguished Professor of Corporate and Business Law

Sid Tarrow, B.A., M.A., Ph.D., Emeritus Professor of Government, Visiting Professor of Law (2014–2017)

Winnie F. Taylor, B.A., J.D., LL.M., Professor of Law, Emerita and Visiting Professor of Law (Fall 2015)

Nelson Tebbe, A.B., J.D., Ph.D., Visiting Professor of Law (Fall 2015)

Chantal Thomas, B.A., J.D., Professor of Law and Director, Clarke Initiative for Law and Development in the Middle East and North Africa

Gerald Torres, A.B., LL.M., J.D., Jane M.G. Foster Professor of Law

Mark A. Underberg, B.A., J.D., Adjunct Professor of Law (Fall 2015)

Laura Underkuffler, B.A., J.D., LL.M., J.S.D., J. DuPratt White Professor of Law

W. Bradley Wendel, B.A., J.D., LL.M., J.S.D., Professor of Law

Robert J. Wertheimer, B.A., J.D., Adjunct Professor of Law (Fall 2015)

Richard C. Wesley, B.A., J.D., Adjunct Professor of Law (Fall 2015)

Chenay B. Weyble, B.A., J.D., Lecturer of Law and Director of Academic Support

Keir M. Weyble, B.S., J.D., Associate Clinical Professor of Law and Director of Death Penalty Litigation

Charles K. Whitehead, B.A., J.D., Myron C. Taylor Alumni Professor of Business Law

Christopher Wiles, B.A., J.D., Adjunct Professor of Law (2015–2016)

Lauren E. Willis, B.A., J.D., Visiting Professor of Law (Fall 2015)

Babak (Bo) Yaghmaie, B.A., J.D., Adjunct Professor of Law (Fall 2015)

Stephen W. Yale-Loehr, B.A., J.D., Adjunct Professor of Law (2015–2016)

Xingzhong Yu, B.A., LL.M., S.J.D., Anthony W. and Lulu C. Wang Professor in Chinese Law

Stephen G. Yusem, B.A., J.D., Adjunct Professor of Law (Fall 2015)

Urs Zulauf, Dr. iur., Adjunct Professor of Law (Fall 2015)

Faculty Emeriti

Roger C. Cramton, A.B., J.D., Robert S. Stevens Professor of Law, Emeritus
Claire M. Germain, Licence-ès-Lettres, LL.B., M.C.L, M.L.L., Edward Cornell Law Librarian (retired) and Professor of Law, Emerita
Jane L. Hammond, B.A., M.S., J.D., Edward Cornell Law Librarian (retired) and Professor of Law, Emerita
James A. Henderson, Jr., A.B., LL.B., LL.M., Frank B. Ingersoll Professor of Law, Emeritus
David B. Lyons, B.A., M.A., Ph.D., Professor of Law, Emeritus and Susan Linn Sage Professor of Philosophy, Emeritus
Peter W. Martin, B.A., J.D., Jane M.G. Foster Professor of Law, Emeritus
Larry I. Palmer, B.A., LL.B., Professor of Law, Emeritus
Ernest F. Roberts, Jr., B.A., LL.B., Edwin H. Woodruff Professor of Law, Emeritus
Faust F. Rossi, B.A., J.D., Samuel S. Leibowitz Professor of Trial Techniques, Emeritus
Steven H. Shiffrin, B.A., M.A., J.D., Charles Frank Reavis Sr. Professor of Law, Emeritus
Gary J. Simson, B.A., J.D., Professor of Law, Emeritus
Katherine Van Wezel Stone, B.A., J.D., Professor of Law, Emerita and Anne Evans Estabrook Professor in Dispute Resolution, Emeritus
Robert S. Summers, B.S., LL.B., LL.D., William G. McRoberts Professor of Research in the Administration of the Law, Emeritus
Winnie F. Taylor, B.A., J.D., LL.M., Professor of Law, Emerita and Visiting Professor of Law (Fall 2015)
Gray Thoron, A.B., LL.B., Professor of Law, Emeritus
Charles W. Wolfram, B.A., LL.B., Charles Frank Reavis Sr. Professor of Law, Emeritus

Associate and Elected Members from Other Faculties

Elizabeth S. Anker, B.A., J.D., Ph.D., Associate Professor, English and Associate Member of the Law Faculty
Calum Carmichael, B.Sc., B.D., B. Litt., LL.D., Professor of Comparative Literature and Biblical Studies, College of Arts and Sciences, and Associate Member of the Cornell Law School Faculty
Alex J. Colvin, J.D., Ph.D., Martin F. Scheinman Professor of Conflict Resolution and Associate Member of the Law Faculty
Martin T. Wells, B.S., M.A., Ph.D., Charles A. Alexander Professor of Social Statistics, NYS School of Industrial and Labor Relations, and Elected Member of the Cornell Law School Faculty

CORNELL LAW REVIEW

Volume 101

November 2015

Number 1

Editor-in-Chief

MATEO J. DE LA TORRE

Executive Editor

BRIAN E. JONES

Managing Editors

ARIEL G. ATLAS
ANTHONY F. BUSCARINO
ALLISON B. EITMAN

SEONG HUON LEE
SALONI R. PATEL
TREVOR N. WHITE

Senior Articles Editor

RYAN A. MADDEN

Senior Online Editor

CHRISTOPHER M. FITZPATRICK

Senior Notes Editor

ANDREW D. HUYNH

Articles Editors

STEVE J. AHN
RYAN W. ALLISON
JOHANNA K. BACHMAIR
ELIZA BEENEY
JOSEPH A. BRUNO
MICHAEL P. DUKE
JENNY JIANGYANG GE
DREW I. GROSSMAN
ALLISON C. HOPPE
RILEY T. KEENAN
NATHAN K. KOSKELLA
ANNA J. MITRAN
CARL L. RIZZI
MATTHEW P. VALENTI

Online Editors

NOGA M. BENMOR-PILTCH
MARIKO A. KOYAMATSU
CESAR SANCHEZ
ADAM J. SZKLANNY

Notes Editors

EMMANUEL HIRAM ARNAUD
DANIEL T. FINNEGAN
ANDREW E. LAI
NATASHA G. MENELL
MARY BETH PICARELLA

Projects Editor

KRISTIN D. DALY-BARNES

Alumni Relations Editor

MARIKO A. KOYAMATSU

Editors

GARRETT M. BIEDERMANN
KRISTIN D. DALY-BARNES
ADAM S. KASSNER
JEE H. KIM
JOHNNY L. KUANG

NA KYUNG LEE
EUNICE LEONG
NICHOLAS R. NAHUM
M. BRIANNA STELLPFLUG
SHEENA P. SULLIVAN

Associates

NICHOLAS G. AMIN
PAIGE C. ANDERSON
JULIEN M. ARMSTRONG
PRESTON F. BRUNO
PATRICK C. BRYANT
BRANKA CIMESA
MARK E. DENTON
ANA DRMANOVIC
KELSEY J. FERGUSON
NICOLE A. GREENSTEIN
EVAN G. HALL
JENNA L. HOWARTH
AMELIA C. HRITZ
NICHOLAS J. JACQUES
KATHERINE S. JEFFERY

EVAN A. JOHNSON
CHRISTINE M. JORDAN
DAVID S. KATZ
ANGELA H. KIM
JESSICA S. KIM
MICHELLE W. LEE
MICHAEL J. LEVY
DAVID T. LISANTE
JAMIE P. LONG
THADDEUS J. LOPATKA
YILONG LUO
ADAM W. MCCALL
ANDREW S. MCDONOUGH
SAMANTHA J. OSTROM

JASON P. OTTOMANO
WILLIAM C. PELLETT
MICHAEL J. PHELAN
VICTOR J. PINEDO
CAISA E. ROYER
CAITLIN A. SAGGESE
RANDOLPH JACOB SHANER
MERRITT L. STEELE
ZACHARY J. STOLL
AASHIM USGAONKAR
TYLER W. VANDEVENTER
ALEXA L. VARGA
MATTHEW S. VASILAKOS
ADENA L. WAYNE
ANTHONY S. WU

Faculty Advisor

JOSH CHAFETZ

Administrative Assistant

SUSAN G. PADO

Antidiscrimination Statement

It is the policy of the *Cornell Law Review* to support equality of opportunity. No person shall be denied membership in the *Cornell Law Review* or participation in any of its activities, including publication, on the basis of any legally prohibited discrimination involving, but not limited to, such factors including race, color, creed, religion, national or ethnic origin, sex, sexual orientation, age, or disability. To improve the overall quality of its publication, the *Cornell Law Review* hopes to expand its membership to include persons from traditionally underrepresented groups, as well as persons with diverse viewpoints. Sexual harassment is an act of discrimination and, as such, will not be tolerated.

Permission

The *Cornell Law Review* hereby grants permission to nonprofit organizations to reproduce and distribute the contents of this journal, in whole or in part, for educational purposes, including distribution to students, provided that the copies are distributed at or below cost and identify the author, the *Cornell Law Review*, the volume, the number of the first page of the article, and the year of publication.

All other inquiries for permission should be sent to the attention of the Editor-in-Chief.

Publication Information

This journal is published six times annually, in November, January, March, May, July, and September at Lincoln, Nebraska, by the *Cornell Law Review* (ISSN 0010-8847). Periodicals postage is paid at Ithaca, New York, and additional mailing offices. Office of Publication: Cornell Law School, 127 Myron Taylor Hall, Ithaca, New York 14853. Printing Office: Joe Christensen, Inc., 1540 Adams Street, Lincoln, Nebraska 68521. POSTMASTER: Send address changes to the *Cornell Law Review*, Cornell Law School, 127 Myron Taylor Hall, Ithaca, New York 14853.

Subscription Information

Annual subscriptions are \$45.00. Single issues are \$15.00 for issues in the current volume. Foreign subscribers should add \$4.00 for postage fees. The Cornell Alumni Association members who wish to receive a subscription to the *Cornell Law Review* need to contact the *Law Review* office directly to arrange the subscription. Your subscription will be automatically renewed unless notification to the contrary is received by the *Cornell Law Review*.

Please notify the *Cornell Law Review* of any change of address at least 30 days before the date of the issue from which the change is to take effect. The postal service will not forward your copies unless extra postage is provided by you. Duplicate copies will not be sent free of charge.

Subscribers should report nonreceipt of copies within six months of the expected mailing date. Issues in Volumes 1 through 100 are available through: William S. Hein & Co., Inc., 2350 North Forest Road, Getzville, New York 14068-1296 (<http://www.wshein.com/>).

Please address correspondence to:

Cornell Law Review
Myron Taylor Hall
Ithaca, NY 14853-4901

Fax (607) 255-7193
Business Office (607) 255-3387
E-mail sgp6@cornell.edu